

Draft Meeting Minutes

California Teleconnect Fund (CTF) Administrative Committee (AC) Meeting

828 I Street, Sacramento, CA 95814

West Meeting Room

June 3, 2024

The meeting was called to order at 10:31 a.m.

1. Introductions

Committee Members Present: Jarrid Keller – Sacramento Public Library (Chairperson, Libraries), Geoff Belleau (Co-Chairperson, California Department of Education), Kenneth Rothschild (Deaf/Hard of Hearing Representative), Madison Alcalay (Public Advocates Office Alternate) – Virtually, Sean McLaughlin – Access Humboldt (Community Based Organization), Saira Pasha – AT&T (LEC), Josh Chisom – California Public Library – Virtually, Max Perrey (Redwood Community Health Coalition) – Virtually, Ali Dias (California Department of Education Alternate) – Virtually

CPUC Staff Present: Joy Alba-Librojo (CTF) – Virtually, Karo Serle (CTF), Connie Wong (CTF) – Virtually, Miriam Sidney (CTF) – Virtually, Kirsten Mueting (CTF), Siamack (Bubba) Donighi (CTF), Lisa-Marie Clark (Legal) – Virtually

Public Participants Present: Kim Lewis (CENIC), Jim Dolganas (CENIC), Kristina Mattis (Education) – Virtually, Josh Phommachakr, Kristina Mattis (California Department of Education) – Virtually, Tamara Broman (CDE) – Virtually, Michelle Harken (K-12) - Virtually

American Sign Language Interpreters Present: Josh Anderson, Jen Wiler

Absent Members: Joshua Cooper – Public Advocates Office (PAO Primary), Quinlan Fang (CTF), Lina Khoury (CTF), Vincent Le (Greenlining CBO)

2. Public Comments on Non-Agenda Items

- Member of the Public Jim Dolganas states he is interested in understanding the definition of public hospital according to the committee. CTF Staff Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark states it would depend on the applicant whether they were eligible for the CTF program. We look at specifics when we review applications to determine which qualify for CTF program. Member of the Public Jim Dolganas asks when thinking of places like Kaiser, a non-profit organization, would we consider those types of places to be public hospitals? CTF Staff Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark states that to qualify for CTF it must be a government hospital as well.

3. Review Agenda

- Chair Jarrid Keller states that members of the committee got their annual report submitted early. The annual Report Review will be added to the agenda as an action item.
- No other comments on the agenda.

4. Review and Approve 3/4/24 Meeting Minutes

- The meeting minutes need to be updated to correct the spelling of AC Member Saira Pasha's name and indicate that she had attended virtually.
- Co-Chair Geoff Belleau – Motion to approve meeting minutes.
- AC Member Saira Pasha– Seconds the motion.
- Meeting minutes are approved.

5. Action Items & Updates from Last Committee Meeting.

a. Jarrid and Geoff will present the proposed draft of Charter changes.

Chair Jarrid Keller and Co-Chair Geoff Belleau have come up with minor proposed changes to the charter. They would like committee approval to work to refine charter language surrounding any input received today and submit the charter revision to the CPUC.

- Officially Recognize Deaf/Hard of Hearing or Disabled Communities. No longer use the language of Hearing Impaired.
AC Member Sean McLaughlin states that we may also want to adopt the name of the Public Advocates Office as the successor to Rate Payer Advocate.
- Look at the long-standing issue of the budget. The budget process has changed, but our duties surrounding the budget have not.
- CTF Staff Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark states that she will review if we are in line with the quorum and teleconferencing policy. We need clarification on Bagley Keene.
- AC Member Sean McLaughlin asks if we should take a look at the language in Section 3.2 to aid in filling these positions. He suggests adding language similar to “or as the committee determines.” CTF Staff Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark states that this might be statutory language, and she would like to follow up on this. She also states that the last sentence here allows for some flexibility. The board can still nominate and present to the Executive Director. Member of the Public Kim Lewis states that the Commission issued guidance on this in 2019. CTF Staff Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark stated that we should put the Commission guidance language into Section 3.2.
- AC Member Sean McLaughlin motions that we authorize the chair and co-chair to take our input today, refine the language, and submit the charter revision to the CPUC.
- AC Member Kenneth Rothschild seconds the motion.
- Roll call vote – All voted yes, and the motion passed.

b. CTF Staff to inquire regarding Enterprise license for OneDrive / SharePoint

- CTF Staff Member Karo Serle states that CTF is not able to share our files as we are employees of a state agency. If anyone would like a specific document, please reach out to CTF, and we can provide those as we are able to.

- Chair Jarrid Keller states that in discussion with CTF Staff Member Karo Serle he has set up a shared file for our meeting minutes, past meeting information, recruitment letters, links to decisions, resolutions, and the like. Chair Jarrid Keller will send a link to the file location.
- AC Member Sean McLaughlin asks if these are public documents. Chair Jarrid Keller states that they are. This is meant to solve the issue of documents getting lost in emails. AC Member Sean McLaughlin clarifies that this is about increasing our ability to share documents with each other as opposed to another way to distribute information to the public and Chair Jarrid Keller confirms this is for efficiency. CTF Staff Member Karo Serle states that information will still be available to the public on the CTF website.
- AC Member Sean McLaughlin states that this sounds great. It would be fantastic to have a place for the public to also access our past meeting minutes, and the like. Also, would we want to have some sort of area where we can find all the materials for each meeting, which is not accessible to the public since this will include draft documents? Chair Jarrid Keller states this is a great thing to work toward, and we do intend to do that.
- AC Member Kenneth Rothschild asks if it is possible to search by keyword within the location that holds the archive documents. CTF Staff Member Karo Serle states that with this, the Chair would compile the folder, and you can search by keywords within that folder. Chair Jarrid Keller states that this is phase one. Currently, we are just getting documents in one place. From there, we intend to move toward PDFs. Next meeting we will be able to share more of it.
- AC Member Sean McLaughlin motioned to approve the development of a shared drive. AC Member Kenneth Rothschild seconded the motion. A roll call vote was used. All voted yes.
- The motion was approved unanimously.

c. Annual Report Review

- Chair Jarrid Keller states that the normal filing period is in October, but they would like to file early. Changes include language changes.
- Chair Jarrid Keller states that the report needs to update the title from Hearing Impaired to Hard of Hearing on page 8 of the document.
- The budgeting process has changed. Chair Jarrid Keller added a statement that reflects when the budget changed and acknowledges past budget efforts. Member of the Public Kim Lewis asked if we could site the specific Commission decision documenting the change and why it occurred. CTF Staff Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark stated that she would look into this.
- Summary of CTF AC Duties – Cleaned up language to reflect what is in the Charter.
- AC Member Sean McLaughlin asks if we should refer to which Order Instituting Rulemaking (OIR) and clarify in this section. CTF Staff Attorney

Lisa-Marie Clark states that we do not have specific proceedings assigned and the last OIR has been closed out. Member of the Public Kim Lewis states this was Rulemaking 13-01-010. CTF Staff Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark asks that we refer to that Rulemaking, state that it has closed, and that the CPUC prefers to open a new rulemaking.

- Member of the Public Kim Lewis asked if we could add a commission decision or similar document ending the change and why it had occurred on page three of the document. CTF Staff Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark stated that she would look into this some more.
- AC Member Sean McLaughlin requested that CTF Staff Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark share the Bagley-Keene document via email. CTF Staff Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark confirms she will do so.
- No additional comments or discussion on this proposed annual report.
- AC Member Kenneth Rothschild motions that we adopt the review changes. AC Member Sean McLaughlin seconds the motion.
- Roll call vote was used. Voted Yes: Jarrid Keller, Co-Chair Geoff Belleau, AC Member Kenneth Rothschild, AC Member Madison Alcalay, AC Member Saira Pasha, AC Member Sean McLaughlin. No response from AC Member Max Perrey.
- The motion passes.

6. Discussion of Administrative Committee Vacancies

a. Public Hospitals and Clinics – Primary and Alternate Vacancies

b. Rural Clinics and Telemedicine – Alternate Vacancy

- AC Member Max Perrey asked if this sector refers to clinics that are run by hospitals or if federal and free clinics, unaffiliated to hospitals, can also represent this sector. CTF Staff Member Karo Serle states those would be acceptable; the keyword is rural. Max stated that he had reached out to find an alternate but could reach back out and mention it on some upcoming calls he has.
- AC Member Sean McLaughlin asked if the only difference between the Rural Clinics and Telemedicine and Public Hospitals and Clinics is that one is rural and one is not. CTF Staff Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark states we have not specifically defined rural clinics and telemedicine and there have been some questions about which specific government hospitals should be allowed to participate in CTF. We have had some applications denied due to other reasons, like the revenue cap. This is an area that we need to explore. AC Member Sean McLaughlin stated that many hospitals in Eureka County are rural. He has reached out to some, and they are capacity-constrained. This is a challenge here and it seems we would not want to limit the definition as we do want to get some representation here.
- Member of the Public Jim Dolganas states that he does not see any reason to limit representation at the AC meeting using the revenue cap. CTF Staff Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark agrees that she does not see a specific reason

here, and this would be a case-by-case basis. She stated that we could reach out to the Department of State Hospitals. AC Member Max Perrey stated that he believes the organization that he works for would not be eligible for CTF, but he is able to represent organizations that may be eligible.

c. Local Exchange Carrier – Alternate Vacancy

- AC Member Saira Pasha states that she has not received responses here. She believes they may be part of other committees or busy.

d. Deaf/Hard of Hearing – Alternate Vacancy

- AC Member Kenneth Rothschild stated that he has just realized he may have unintentionally limited his outreach because he has not reached out to the general disabled community. He asked if we all could help assist with any contacts we may have in the general disabled community.

BREAK 11:41

RESUME MEETING 11:55

7. Presentation by committee member AC Member Saira Pasha of AT&T

- AC Member Saira Pasha gave a presentation highlighting the work that carriers do in communities. The presentation included information on investment in bridging the digital divide, including increasing internet access in rural areas, learning centers, and providing low-cost options for individuals who have lost the Affordable Connectivity Program (ACP) subsidy.
- AC Member Sean McLaughlin asked if they partner with anyone in the Learning Centers. AC Member Saira Pasha stated that she believes they do partner with CBOs, with AT&T providing technology and laptops.
- AC Member Sean McLaughlin asked what the vision is for bridging the digital divide without a carrier of last resort, considering AT&T had applied for removal. AC Member Saira Pasha stated that this application had been denied.
- AC Member Sean McLaughlin asked how they see the impact of the Federal Communications Commission (FCC) shift in how they are applying Title Two designations to broadband providers. AC Member Saira Pasha stated she does not have any information she can share on this at this time.

8. eCAP Update

a. Applications/Recertifications

- CTF Staff discussed CTF applications data.
- AC Member Sean McLaughlin inquired about why $\frac{3}{4}$ of the CBO applications were rejected. CTF Staff Siamack (Bubba) Donighi stated this could be some organizations not meeting the qualifications required such as net revenue cap. He clarifies that rejections happen when CTF staff determines an application is deficient, requests additional information or a correction and the applicant does not respond in the required time frame. AC Member Sean

McLaughlin stated that they would love to know any patterns that CTF sees that might shed light on why this may be happening.

- AC Member Saira Pasha asked if we would be able to see the same data for the same period in the previous year for comparison. CTF Staff Member Siamack (Bubba) Donighi stated that he does not have that data with him at the moment, but he was able to show last quarters data.
- AC Member Sean McLaughlin stated that he has heard feedback about application forms asking for information that organizations have difficulty providing. CTF Staff Member Karo Serle stated CTF applications require common documents, such as tax documents and the qualifying services worksheet. The qualifying worksheet may be the aspect of the application that feedback is about. CTF needs to ensure that qualifying services are at least 50% of the mission, and because of that, we do need applicants to provide this information. We may be able to do a better job communicating what is required here. AC Member Sean McLaughlin stated that it may be a matter of encouraging applicants to reach out to us for help to combat applicants feeling intimidated by this. CTF Staff Member Siamack (Bubba) Donighi stated that in our deficiency letters, we include our individual work emails and encourage the applicant to reach out to us. He asks that committee members please inform CTF of any feedback they are hearing as it helps us to improve.
- There is a typo on the slide. It should say 40 instead of 4040 government hospitals.
- Member of the Public Jim Dolganask asked why public schools and libraries are being rejected. CTF Staff Member Siamack (Bubba) Donighi stated it could be that they had applied under the wrong category or that they did not provide the requested documentation after receiving a deficiency letter. He stated that these applicants are always welcome to reapply.
- AC Member Kenneth Rothschild asked if CTF would be able to provide screenshots of the process. CTF Staff Member Siamack (Bubba) Donighi stated that we have a video walkthrough of the process on the CTF website. CTF Staff Member Karo Serle added that we have a manual as well and we can get those materials to AC Member Kenneth Rothschild.

b. Claims and Program Finances

- CTF Staff Member Karo Serle stated that CTF Staff Member Quinlan Fang had an emergency and was not able to be at the meeting today. CTF Staff Member Karo Serle presented these slides in his place.
- AC Member Sean McLaughlin asked if CTF is confident that 2023 is closed and, if not, when we will know the final numbers here. CTF Staff Member Karo Serle stated that the fiscal year ends, and we give carriers three months after that. AC Member Sean McLaughlin stated the 2021 & 2022 numbers are final, but it is too early to say the current year is final and CTF Staff Member Karo Serle confirmed.

- AC Member Sean McLaughlin stated it would be good to see the reduction by category as he would assume it is mostly from CBOs. Member of the Public Kim Lewis stated they would like to see 2024 numbers in comparison to 2019 numbers to enable AC members to see any change post-eCAP implementation, broken down by category.
- Member of the Public Kim Lewis asks that CTF Staff get clarification on the jump from 12/31/2023 to 1/31/2024. CTF Staff Member Siamack (Bubba) Donighi stated this appears to be a typo and he will confirm.
- Chair Jarrid Keller stated that they are beginning to hear more positive feedback about eCAP and thank CTF for its efforts here.

9. CTF Outreach

a. Planned outreach to Community-Based Organizations and other sectors.

- CTF Staff Member Karo Serle stated that CTF met with AC Member Vincent Le to get his insight on potential outreach efforts. CTF is creating a flyer and very short videos with graphics to show how to apply and similar program information to what will be on the flyer. Once our flyer is done and approved, we will share it with the committee. CTF Staff Member Siamack (Bubba) Donighi adds that CTF Staff Member Kirsten Mueting has been compiling data from public sources like IRS Form 990s, which we plan to use to find CBOs we could distribute our flyer to. We are open to any recommendations here.
- AC Member Sean McLaughlin stated that CBO is different from any other category and asked if we could all get together on this. CTF Staff Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark stated that you can notice a meeting, or you can do two meetings, each with no more than 2 committee members. AC Member Sean McLaughlin stated noticing might be a good idea because it may encourage CBO participation.

10. Update on Los Angeles County Office of Education.

- CTF Staff Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark stated there is no update from the last report as we are still waiting for their petition. We may go ahead and put this in the scope of the proceeding, depending on how quickly we can get the rulemaking on the calendar. CTF Staff Member Karo Serle stated that we did have an eCAP bug, but that has been resolved and we have directed LACOE to apply for the schools.

11. School Annex Update

- CTF Staff Member Karo Serle stated that we have transitioned the program to include the school annexes that provide instructional services. CTF will cover any instructional facility that is tied to a school. Chair Jarrid Keller asked if we would hear more about library annexes in the future. CTF Staff Member Karo Serle confirms that there have been discussions surrounding this and we are working on it.

12. Pending Legislation

a. AB 3020 2-1-1 Infrastructure Act

- Member of the Public Kim Lewis stated that this bill is not moving forward due to budget restrictions.
- No other updates on pending legislation.

13. Agenda Items for Next Meeting

- a. CTF will invite DDGP recipients to present.
 - Co-Chair Geoff Belleau mentions they would love to hear from kids and teachers as well. CTF Staff Member Karo Serle confirms we can ask for more qualitative data here.
- b. CTF Staff will present 2019-present fund data broken down by category, year, and quarter to enable AC members to view trends post-eCAP implementation, broken down by category.
- c. CTF Staff get clarification on the jump from 12/31/2023 to 1/31/2024 in fund data.
- d. PAO will follow up with management on if they want to do a presentation.
- e. Potentially update the eligible services for service providers.
- f. Chair Jarrid Keller will send a link to the shared folder.
- g. CTF will edit the previous meeting minutes to correct the spelling of AC Member Saira Pasha's name and indicate that she had attended virtually.
- h. CTF Staff will provide AC Member Kenneth Rothschild with screenshots of the application process and other materials.

14. Confirm scheduling of September AC Meeting for Monday, September 9, 2024, in San Francisco.

- a. **Meeting is scheduled for 9/9/24 at 10:30 am in San Francisco**

Motion to adjourn by Chair Jarrid Keller. Seconded by AC Member Saira Pasha.

Meeting adjourned at 1:13 p.m.