**California Teleconnect Fund (CTF) Administrative Committee (AC) Meeting**

828 I Street, Sacramento, CA 95814

West Meeting Room

December 2, 2024

**The meeting was called to order at 10:30 a.m.**

1. **Introductions**

**Committee Members Present:** Jarrid Keller – Sacramento Public Library (Chairperson, Libraries), Geoff Belleau (Co-Chairperson, California Department of Education), Madison Alcalay (Public Advocates Office Primary) – Virtually, Prescott Matthews (Public Advocates Office Alternate) – Virtually, Saira Pasha – AT&T (Local Exchange Carrier), Sean McLaughlin – Access Humboldt (Community Based Organization) – Virtually, Josh Chisom (California Public Library Alternate) – Virtually, Vinhcent Le – Greenlining (Community Based Organization) – Virtually.

**CPUC Staff Present:** Lina Khoury (CTF) – Virtually, Joy Alba-Librojo (CTF) – Virtually, Karo Serle (CTF) – Virtually, Connie Wong (CTF) – Virtually, Miriam Sidney (CTF) – Virtually, Siamack Donighi (CTF) – Virtually, Peter Chang (CTF) – Virtually, Daniel Lyulkin (CTF), Kirsten Mueting (CTF), Lisa-Marie Clark (Legal).

**Public Participants Present:** Kim Lewis (CENIC), Russell McCurdy (IT, Sacramento Public Library), Ribindra Gaur (California Department of Education), Charlotte Perrault (Public Advocates Office) - Virtually, Ernesto Falcon, Peter Pratt (Public Advocates Office) – Virtually, Sherilyn Evans (CENIC) – Virtually, Gelarah Safavi (CTF), Tyler Hodgson (Outside the Lens), Jesse Stein (Outside the Lens).

**Absent Members:** Kenneth Rothschild (Deaf/Hard of Hearing Representative), Max Perrey – Redwood Community Health Clinic (RCHC), Ali Dias (California Department of Education Alternate).

**Roll Call:** Quorum is met.

1. **Public Comments on Non-Agenda Items**

* No comments.

1. **Review Agenda**

* AC Member Sean McLaughlin comments that he would like to be sure we allow enough time for updates and agenda items.
* AC Chair Jarrid Keller agrees.

1. **Review and Approve September 9, 2024 Meeting Minutes**

* No comments.
* AC Member Vinhcent Le – Motion to approve meeting minutes.
* AC Member Sean McLaughlin – Seconds the motion.
* Roll call vote. All vote yes.
* September 9, 2024 meeting minutes are approved.

1. **Action Items & Updates from Last Committee Meeting.**

* No comments.

1. **Discussion of Administrative Committee Vacancies:**

* **Public Hospitals and Clinics – Primary and Alternate vacancies.**
  + No updates.
* **Rural Clinics and Telemedicine – Alternate vacancy.**
  + Chair Jarrid Keller states that we have potentially identified someone for this vacancy.
* **Local Exchange Carrier - Alternate vacancy.**
  + No updates.
* **Deaf/Hard of Hearing - Alternate vacancy.**
  + No updates.
* **Community Based Organization - Alternate vacancy.**
  + No updates.
* **Public Advocates Office – Primary vacancy.**
  + Maddison Alcalay is the primary and Prescott Matthews is the alternate.

1. **2025 Strategic Planning Discussion.**

* AC Chair Jarrid Keller states that he and AC Co-Chair Geoff Belleau believe that the committee could benefit from a strategic plan. They believe that this could serve to reboot and unite one clear message to ensure that future iterations of this committee will continue to thrive. They propose that we make a plan to guide us for the next four or five years, prioritizing allocating resources efficiently.
* AC Chair Jarrid Keller recommends a collaborative approach using SMART goals with ownership of defined roles and specific measurable objectives every year aligned with CTF’s mission.
* AC Chair Jarrid Keller proposes a strategic planning summit to develop a strategic plan for CTF and this committee. They would like to set up a subcommittee for this.
* CTF Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark states that this is perfect timing to develop a strategic plan for coming years as CTF will be opening an Order Instituting Rulemaking (OIR) soon. The OIR will include opportunities to update the charter, and to consider committee vacancies. It is currently under review by ALJ division and Lisa-Marie Clark is unable to speak to specific details. A preview of the topics considered in the OIR is:
  + Open up discussion on forward looking component surrounding issues that are ongoing with LACOE
  + Address CTF Participant definition to resolve confusion surrounding third parties managing eCAP accounts for organizations
  + Discussion of tribal organizations and how we incorporate tribal entities (carriers and participants) operating on tribal land
  + Discussion of how to incorporate participation of school districts and county education offices
  + Issues related to non-profit private school, library annexes, CBOs, government hospitals and skilled nursing facilities
  + CBO revenue requirements and how these are calculated
  + Updates to eligible services to align with recent FCC update
  + Code of conduct for participants
  + ELJ issues
  + Additional clarity on the process of appealing a decision about an organization’s participation in the program
  + Administrative charter updates
* AC Co-Chair Geoff Belleau states he is glad to hear that we will talk about districts and counties. There are schools that are eRate eligible that are not getting CTF discounts because of these issues. This is a related, but separate, issue to the LACOE situation.
* CTF Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark states that Cenic has an arm that operates as a service provider. We have had difficulty getting documents between Cenic, the provider, and the third party managing the participant accounts. There are limits there. We would like to address these issues in the OIR.
* AC Co-Chair Geoff Belleau states that whatever CTF does not pick up, Proposition 98 has to pick up. It would be great for CTF to help.
* CTF Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark states it is important to be on the record how Cenic participates. We encourage all different organizations within this committee to participate in the OIR separately. Do not represent yourself as the committee. The strategic plan could be an interesting thing for us to incorporate into the OIR. If the subcommittee approves something or brings it to the larger group to approve, we can submit that as a letter into the correspondence for the OIR. This would allow it to be considered by the Commission. We cant submit as a committee, but we can submit individually and support as a committee.
* AC Member Sean McLaughlin states that we want to ensure we do not relitigate. The immediate OIR is fundamental in reviewing the charter and redefining the role of this committee. The challenge is to avoid micro litigating the interests of all the groups at the table. These conversations are very important and we would want the committee to step back and look at the bigger picture.
* CTF Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark states that the committee is its own decisional body with the right to make recommendations that are contrary to the CPUC. The rules may have been muddy in the past, but time has passed, and we will not be relitigating any of these micro issues of if schools, CBOs or libraries are top priority, for example. We do not treat the different participant types on different priority levels in that way. We are guided by statute. There will not be much difference in how the program looks today and what it will look like after this. It will be refined and not rewritten.
* AC Chair Jarrid Keller states that he understands past frustrations but believes that the strategic plan is important for us to come together. It shows, as a committee, we have some skin in the game by really trying to plan out the next years.
* CTF Staff Karo Serle that during the last OIR we were going through a budget crisis. He believes that it was not perfect, but it was not a disaster.
* AC Member Sean McLaughlin apologizes for coming across like he was saying it was a disaster. He believes that if you look at the results of before and after the last OIR, it was harmful and damaging to the goals of the program, specifically for CBOs. He suggests making this a two-day retreat to ensure we can get in depth planning, but understands that is unlikely. He states that he understands there has been great progress and work done here but is frustrated by lack of progress in the CBO sector.
* AC Member Saira Pasha asks if the OIR will have some allowance for doing workshops for parties that will be engaged.
* CTF Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark states that this could potentially be issued this year but is more likely to be issued in the first quarter of 2025. It is not limited to the issues she has discussed here today. There is a conference that the ALJ would be issuing where parties would be able to raise any issue they believe to be important to address in this proceeding – including workshops, en bancs etc. We do want as much input as possible from all parties to get the funds used as well as possible.
* AC Chair Jarrid Keller proposes a meeting in January 2025 to start the strategic planning. He can host in this location on January 13th or 27th. This would be a long day, and they are willing to facilitate.
* Multiple members state they are available on January 27th.
* AC Chair Jarrid Keller states that in person is preferred. He will schedule for January 27, 2025 at the Sacramento Public Library at 10 AM. The library will provide lunch for those who attend in person. This can operate without staff support, but they can reach out to staff beforehand.
* CTF Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark asks that any information be sent through staff to ensure we do not break any rules.
* CTF Staff Karo Serle states that he would like to take a moment to introduce the newest CTF team member, Peter Chang.

**Break at 11:26am - 11:41am**

1. **Presentation by DDGP grantees.**
2. **Presentation by Public Advocates Office (PAO).**
3. **eCAP Update.**
   1. AC Member Sean McLaughlin asks if we can get reports showing trendlines or similar going forward.
   2. CTF Staff Miriam Sidney requests that AC Member Sean McLaughlin send an email with the request and states that we will work toward the request.
4. **CTF Outreach.**

* CTF Staff Karo Serle states that we are taking applications from library and school annexes. Administrative Letter 32 was sent to all CTF Service Providers on October 16, 2024.

1. **Communications Division Resolutions.**

* CTF staff provided brief descriptions of the following resolutions:
  + T-17842 Digital Divide Grant permanent
  + T-17832 Plumas 211
  + T-17834 Yuba 211
  + T-17837 San Benito 211
  + T-17848 CTF Expansion of Eligible Services
* AC Member Sean McLaughlin asks if Resolution T-17842 changes the funding mechanism for DDGP.
* CTF Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark states that this does not change the funding mechanism set out by statute. It lives within the CTF Fund but the funds for the CTF program can’t be transferred over to the DDGP program.
* AC Member Sean McLaughlin asks how much money is involved with the 211 resolutions and where it comes from.
* CTF Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark states it is separate from CTF Fund. The program authorizes 211 but it is funded separately and the specific 211 funding that was offered in prior years has sunseted.
* AC Member Sean McLaughlin asks if we know how many are without 211 right now.
* CTF Staff Lina Khoury states that 14 counties do not have 211 services at this time. They are small counties and their budget is restricted. There are full service 211 services and emergency 211 services. We are looking into finding ways to find some funds via Senate or Assembly bills to fund at least the emergency 211 services in the approximately 14 counties.
* AC Member Saira Pasha asks when the changes in Resolution T-17848 are going into effect.
* AC Member Daniel Lyulkin states that we are adhering to the FCC timeline of July 2025.

1. **Update on Los Angeles County Office of Education (LACOE).**

* CTF Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark states that we will be discussing these issues in the OIR. We had tried to resolve the issue offline between staff and LACOE, but have not found success in these efforts.
* AC Member Sean McLaughlin states some of the LACOE issues have raised questions about CENICs role as well.
* CTF Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark states that this was the big issue we were encountering, but she is unable to disclose any details here. LACOE is operating as a service provider. Under current program rules, in order to be a service provider, you have to have a CPCN. LACOE cannot get a CPCN. CPCNs are required due to a non CTF specific rule.
* AC Member Sean McLaughlin asks if CENIC is in a similar situation, acting as a service provider.
* Member of the Public Kim Lewis states that CENIC is not a service provider. CBI (Cenic Broadband Initiative, LLC) is a subsidiary of CENIC and does have a CPCN. There is no duplication of service.
* CTF Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark states that this is an issue we will probably raise in the OIR just to give clarity on CENICs role in the CTF program.

1. **School Annex Update. Video.**

* CTF Staff Karo Serle states that CTF had a school annex webinar on October 8, 2024. CTF is also planning a webinar for service providers in January. CTF is also increasing efforts to reach out to CBOs and HCBOs utilizing our outreach flyer and video.
* The CTF Outreach video was shown.

1. **Pending Legislation.**

* Member of the public Kim Lewis states that today is the first day of the 2025 session and there is no pending legislation at this time.
* AC Member Sean McLaughlin asks if there is a more regular methodology we can use to identify PUC related regulation in California.
* CTF Attorney Lisa-Marie Clark states we do have an office that presents CPUC related bills that we are seeking to get introduced. If there is a CTF related bill that is up for consideration, they would inform the team and seek our advice. Currently, we don’t have any specific bills that the CPUC itself is introducing. Our Communications Division and Legal Division interact very closely with proceedings before the FCC. We can provide that information when we have it.

1. **Agenda Items for Next Meeting.**

* DDGP awardee presentation
* 2-1-1 presentation by CTF staff
* Debrief on January 27, 2025 strategic planning session.
* Update on LACOE

1. **Confirm scheduling of March 2025**

* Future meeting dates scheduled as follows: Monday, March 10, 2025 10:30am at Sacramento Public Library, West Meeting Room.

AC Member Saira Pasha motioned to adjourn the meeting. AC Member Sean McLaughlin seconded the motion.

**Meeting Adjourned at 1:25 pm**