



California Public
Utilities Commission

ULTS Administrative Committee Meeting

Meeting Minutes

December 10, 2024

Please join the California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) for the Q4 2024 Universal LifeLine Telephone Service Administrative Committee Meeting.

When: Tuesday, December 10, 2024 (9:00 am – 12:00 pm)

Where: 505 Van Ness Ave., Golden Gate Room, San Francisco, CA 94102

WebEx Meeting Link: <https://cpuc.webex.com/cpuc/j.php?MTID=m03bc2199e15de609cf2561059c64dd85>

Call-in Number: 1-855-282-6330 **Access Code:** 249 693 30047 **Meeting Password:** 2024

California LifeLine Program Meeting Agenda

Session 1: Welcome & Kick-Off

Session Outcome: Meeting Kick-Off

Session Topics: Welcome, Opening Remarks, Public Comments

9:00 a.m. – 9:05 a.m.	Introduction: David Avila, Chair
9:05 a.m. – 9:10 a.m.	Welcome:
9:10 a.m. – 9:15 a.m.	Approval of Minutes: Committee reviews and approval of the last meeting minutes prepared by the Communications Division (CD)
9:15 a.m. – 9:20 a.m.	Public Comments

Session 2: Program Alerts & New News

Session Outcome: Inform Critical Program Updates

Session Topics: New News, Alerts & Highlights

9:20 a.m. – 9:45 a.m.	CPUC Communications Division (CD) Updates: Robert Sansone <ul style="list-style-type: none">No SSN Proposed Decision
-----------------------	--

Session 3: Program Performance & Metrics

Session Outcome: Understand "What's Working" vs. What's Not Working"
Session Topics: Internal & External Past Quarter Performance & Future Guidance

9:45 a.m. – 9:55 a.m.	Fiscal Report: Lalaine Semana
9:55 a.m. – 10:05 a.m.	Claims Status: Lisa Anthony

Session 4: Program Enrollment & Operations

Session Outcome: Understand Consumers Enrolling & Staying on the Program
Session Topics: Operational Topics & Updates

10:05 a.m. – 10:25 a.m.	3 rd Party Administrator - Maximus Report: James Graettinger
	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Completed Initiatives and Impact• Upcoming Initiatives• Program & Operation Reports
10:25 a.m. – 10:35 a.m.	Foster Youth - Maximus
10:35 a.m. – 10:45 a.m.	BREAK

Session 5: Growth & Strategy

Session Outcome: Exploring How to Achieve Program Growth
Session Topics: Industry, Special Initiatives, External Collaborations

10:45 a.m. – 10:50 a.m.	CAB Consumer Contact Statistics Report: Sydney Williams
10:50 a.m. – 11:00 a.m.	USAC Update: David Avila

Session 6: Committee Administration & Governance

Session Outcome: Lifeline Committee Management, Deliverables & Commitments
Session Topics: Committee Deliverables, Sub-Team Reports/Read-Outs, Calendars

11:00 a.m. – 11:15 a.m.	Committee Vote – Review and vote on the Wireless vacancy application.
11:15 a.m. – 11:25 a.m.	ULTS Administrative Committee Charter positions: 10 Open Positions <ul style="list-style-type: none">• CLEC – 1 Alternate• Consumer – 1 Alternate• CBO – 2 Alternates• Wireless – 1 Primary, 1 Alternate• Sister Agency – 1 Primary, 1 Alternate• Office of the Tribal Advisor – 1 Primary, 1 Alternate
11:25 a.m. – 11:35 a.m.	Future Q1 Meeting Date
11:35 a.m. – 11:45 a.m.	Meeting Adjourned

Member Roster

1	ILEC	Primary Alternate	Chris Burke Vacant	Frontier Communication
2	CLEC	Primary Alternate	Vacant Vacant	
3	Wireless	Primary Alternate	David Avila Alex Gudkov	TracFone Wireless, Inc. TruConnect
4	Wireless	Primary Alternate	Robert Yapp Vacant	
5	Consumer	Primary Alternate	Vincent Le Vacant	Greenlining
6	CBO	Primary Alternate	Cesar Motts Vacant	New Start Housing
7	CBO	Primary Alternate	Andre Chapple Vacant	Faith Church, African American Empowerment, Nat'l Diversity Coalition, Answer City Outreach
8	CPUC's Public Advocates Office	Primary Alternate	Christopher Bartulo Vacant	Public Advocates Office
9	Deaf/Hearing Impaired or Disabled Rep	Primary Alternate	Kate Woodford Brian Winic	Cntr for Accessible Technology CA Department of Rehabilitation
10	Sister Agency	Primary Alternate	Vacant Vacant	
11	CA Office of the Tribal Advisor	Primary Alternate	Vacant Vacant	

Meeting Minutes – ULTS-AC Meeting, December 10, 2024, 9:00 am – 12:00 pm

Attendees: 6 primary members and 1 alternate present

Primary members: Chris Burke, Marcie Evans, David Avila, Kate Woodford, Cesar Zaldivar Motts, Christopher Bartulo,

Alternates: Alex Gudkov

Other Attendees: Robert Sansone, Kellie M. Jones, Lisa Anthony, Lalaine L. Semana, Chari Worster, Rosa Sauer, Jim Graettinger, Michael Mullaney, Chari Worster, Gelareh Safavi, Sola Lee, Sindy J. Yun, Robyn Purchia, Joseph Haga, Sandy Lion, Sarah Torres

Introduction: David Avila – Opening remarks.

Approval of Minutes:

- Motion approved by the committee members
- Chris Burke, approved
- Marcie Evans, approved
- David Avila, approved
- Kate Woodford, approved
- Cesar Zaldivar Motts, approved
- Chris Bartula, approved

Public Comments:

- Questions/Comments: N/A

CPUC Communications Division (CD) Updates: Robert Sansone

- NUN SSN PD
For Q4 it was Held in September, October, November, and December voting meetings.
- Issued admin letter on November 1st setting the Specific support amount for 19\$ for 2025.
- Issued admin letter to Align with the FCC guidance wireless plan collecting \$12 upfront. Disseminated that fee across 12 months and how it impacts the nun Usage rule.
- Questions/Comments: N/A

Fiscal Report: Lalaine Semana

See presentation #1: ULTS (Fund 0471) Committee Meeting Report

- For the period ending October 31, 2024 (The first month of the new fiscal)
 - Total Revenue: \$78,639,948
 - Total Appropriation: \$631,931,960
 - Total Expenditures: \$47,271,660
 - Remaining/Available Appropriation: \$565,747,123
 - Total Available Cash as of October 31, 2024: \$594,267,413
 - Total Available Cash as of December 2024: \$577,800.000
- Questions/Comments: N/A

Claims Status: Lisa Anthony

See attachment #2 Fiscal Report

- September 2024 – 86% of all claims approved for June:
 - Wireline: 92% of Claims Received and Approved by CPUC
 - Wireless: 84% of Claims Received and Approved by CPUC
- October 2024 – Service Providers have until December 30th to submit October claims. CPUC staff has received and approved 55% of all claims.
 - Wireline: 84% of Claims Received and Approved by CPUC
 - Wireless: 40% of Claims Received and Approved by CPUC
- November 2024 – Due by January 31st
- Service Providers have 60 days to submit claims after each month's end. If an extension is needed, you can email lifelineclaim@cpuc.ca.gov by that month's deadline.
- Questions/Comments: N/A

3rd Party Administrator – Maximus Report: James Graettinger

See presentation #3 Maximus CA LifeLine – TPA Presentation

- **Completed Initiatives and Impact**
 - On Friday, September 13th, the TPA introduced to the California LifeLine production environment a twenty-four (24) hour portability/transfer freeze. After deployment, all TPA intake systems (SPIA, file, and web) return a 40159 error if a Service Provider attempts to initiate an inter-carrier benefit transfer request within the initial twenty-four (24) hours after the current service term for the subscriber is activated.
 - Using the Automated Eligibility Verification System (AEVS) to Confirm Applicants' Medi-Cal Participation
- **USAC Service Type “BundledBroadband” disabled**
- Questions/Comments:
 - David Avila:** Does that mean that now we are checking the Medi-Cal database to see if we have a participant? What does this change represent?
 - James Graettinger:** It is a fully manual system, a one-by-one check of the Medi-Cal database. AEVS tells the reviewer that the individuals receive Medi-Cal, Medi-Caid, or Medi-Care. Medi-Cal and Medi-Caid do qualify an individual, but Medi-Care does not. This is the first step, therefore being used for the enrolment process but not for the renewal process.

▪ **Upcoming Initiatives**

- Collecting and managing demographic data for Benefit Qualifying Persons (BQP):
An applicant can qualify for LifeLine because a member of their household, who is their child or a dependent, is currently enrolled in a qualifying assistance program. The household member is referred to as a Benefit Qualifying Person (BQP)
Friday, March 7, 2025 – Deployment of BQP-related changes for the TPA's California LifeLine platform
- **Acceptable Eligibility Documentation - CalFresh**
Beginning **Thursday, May 1, 2025**, images of Golden State Advantage cards, and the California EBT card, **WILL NOT be acceptable proof** of CalFresh participation
- Creating a LifeLine enrollment pathway for California residents who cannot provide valid SSN4s
- Establishing an API connection with the Medi-Cal Eligibility Data System (MEDS) to confirm eligibility
- Introducing an eligibility reverification process during the annual renewal for subscribers whose continuing eligibility is not determined by matching external databases
- Requiring wireless Service Providers to submit proof of consumer consent when initiating a LifeLine benefit transfer
- Customer Portal 2.0
- Allow registered portal users to self-initiate enrollments, obtain eligibility determinations, and then select Service Providers and plans [USAC enrollment model]
- Allow registered portal users to change their service addresses, mail addresses, font preferences, and language preferences

Alex Gudkov: Just a suggestion that all the processes right now are designed around electronic signature, so if Maximus was considering signature to be a part of it, just keep in mind if you need to use an electronic signature and not an ink signature.

▪ **Program and Operations Reports**

David Avila: The only thing that I would just throw out to the committee for consideration is this is valuable demographic information to help us understand who's responding to the marketing that our service providers are doing. In 2025, it would probably make sense for some committee members what took place in the last quarter.

Foster youth Maximus CA LifeLine:

See presentation #3 Maximus CA LifeLine – FY TPA Presentation

- Transition of Third-Party Administrator Responsibilities from iFoster to Maximus
 - On July 31, 2024, Third-Party Administrator responsibilities for the California LifeLine Foster Youth Program transitioned from iFoster to Maximus
 - The CPUC and T-Mobile agreed to extend cellular phone service for Foster Youth Pilot subscribers to November 30, 2024
 - Between July 31 and October 31, the TPA “onboarded” representatives of 55 of 58 counties for the TPA’s interim technical solution
 - Currently, Verizon TracFone provides the TPA a monthly report of “first usage” (voice, data, or text) As of December 5th, 1,082 of 2,495 phone lines evidenced “first usage”
 - The TPA has held weekly one (1) hour “office hours” sessions for county representatives. The objective of these sessions has been to provide a virtual, interactive forum for county representatives to ask questions and provide feedback about the Program
 - On August 12, 2024, a meet & greet meeting was held with representatives of the Youth Law Center, the Children’s Law Center, the Foster Youth Education Fund, the CPUC, and the TPA
 - Representatives of the CPUC and the TPA have met twice weekly with representatives of Verizon TracFone to develop protocols for equipment fulfillment and shipping, reporting, and porting T-Mobile phone numbers
- The TPA’s Permanent Technical Platform
 - Deployment of the TPA’s permanent technical platform is targeted for Saturday, February 1, 2025
 - The permanent platform will integrate API-based communication between the TPA and Verizon TracFone for enrollments, program removals, emergency service suspension, and status updates, including address changes
- Questions/Comments:
 - Marcie Evans:** what is the wait List?
 - Robert Sansone:** We were informed of the waitlist as the pilot was ending, and then when we saw the waitlist, we saw that there were youth on the list from, you know, as far back as November of 2023. We didn't understand why some individuals were on the waitlist just that it existed, so we just decided to grandfather all of them in.
 - David Avila:** What headwinds and tailwinds do you see this program facing that we should keep an eye out for your following updates, if any?
 - James Graettinger:** That the youth that applied receives the phone.

Break: 10:19 am – 10:30 am

CAB Consumer Contact Statistics Report: Rosa Sauer

See presentation #4 Quarterly LifeLine Report

- Consumer Affairs Branch LifeLine Overview
 - CAB has dedicated specialists and consumer affairs specialists to assist consumers with LifeLine-related issues:
 - Appealing LifeLine denials
 - Disputing various issues with LifeLine Service Provider
 - Requesting information on the LifeLine application process
 - Resolving consumer questions or complaints with the LifeLine application process regarding Rules/General Order 153; a lot of consumers know the General Order
 - Resolving issues with wireless devices
- LifeLine Contacts Received by CAB: August 2024 – October 2024
- Top LifeLine Contact Categories Received by CAB: August 2024 – October 2024
- LifeLine Contacts Closed by CAB: August 2024 – October 2024
- LifeLine Contacts Received and Closed by CAB: August 2024 – October 2024

Working groups to support CPUC Update by Alex Gudkov:

The group meets every month, and we are in active discussion of Phase Two. So just a reminder, phase one was regarding energy utilities, and the scope was very limited. Phase one is completely frozen, which means that NO updates are being introduced. The goal is to finalize the requirements for phase two to be provided at the beginning of Q1 to CPUC as our recommendation of what we need to do. Phase two is fully based on the success of phase one. It's going to utilize a similar system, just different utilities including telecom. It's a very exciting project; it will allow consumers to apply to multiple programs at the same time.

- Questions/Comments:

Killie Jones: Is this the concurrent application system CAS?

Alex Gudkov: Yes.

USAC Update: David Avila

We continue to monitor the situation closely. As it stands, with the election results known and anticipated changes ahead, strategies for funding low-income and affordability programs are being revisited. The focus is on determining the best approach to advocate for these programs.

Regarding affordability initiatives like Lifeline, discussions are ongoing about potential reforms to make the program more meaningful. However, there is currently no clear strategy in place, which is why much of the current effort is centered on discussions and planning.

Questions/Comments:

Cesar Mott: Do you see any movement to revitalize the affordable broadband program in the federal?

David Avila: Yes, there was a lot of effort to extend it through several congressional bills. But that it never made to vote, now that there's a new administration coming in, there are going to be changes at the FCC level.

Committee Vote – Review and vote on the Wireless vacancy application

- Potential new member: Robert Yapp.
- Committee member resigning: Marcie Evans,
- Committee member retired: Linda Lassen.

Kellie Jones: Robert Yapp is not present but I'm proposing moving forward to voting or opening it up for the next quarters. Resume distributed.

Sindy Yun: Kelly sent out a memo that explains the process for filling vacancies, the committee can vote on the nominee who is Robert Yapp. He submitted his resume to Kellie, and she's provided his resume to the committee, you all should have received his resume. In the past what we have done, we've had the nominees present, attend the meetings, introduce themselves, and have the committee ask any questions. He's not available today, but that does not mean you cannot move forward with his nomination. You can take a vote on his nomination today and if the committee approves, Submit a letter of nomination to the CPUC executive director, Rachel Peterson for appointment approval. The 2nd option would be if you want to have an opportunity to ask Mr. Yapp some questions, you can postpone the election to the next committee meeting and you know Kelly will ensure that he is present at that meeting. So those are two options for the committee today. Additionally, David as a chair, you can also take, open, and ask if anyone has any other nominations that they want to submit. Can anyone nominate themselves or nominate somebody else to fill any of the vacancies?

David Avila: I would prefer if the candidate had been here so committee members could ask questions

and hear directly from the candidate, about how he will be supporting the lifeline program. But I think that after you review his resume and his contribution. If you feel that you could go ahead and vote, maybe we pursue option one. If there are some things that we need some clarifications that we would like something to be explained, then we'll have to postpone and have him address the committee next time to say what would be probably the best course of action.

Robert Sansone: Procedural question for both Kelly and Sindy, with Marcy stepping down, do we expect to meet a quorum in the next meeting?

Kellie Jones: No.

Sindy Yun: Then in that case I think since we have the election on the agenda, we might want to take this opportunity to fill Marcy's position and elect a co-chair today.

Robert Sansone: To balance that out, I'm not trying to force the election, so the alternative method would be for Kelly to reach out to every board member and try to find a date in quarter 1 to ensure a maximum quorum.

Alex Gudkov: I would vote for Wade because we don't know if Robert still wants to join or not, and since he's not present right now, we kind of work, voting in the dark.

Sola Lee: I'm present on behalf of Robert Yapp, and he has conveyed to me that he is still very much interested in the position. He apologizes for not being able to make the meeting in person as he is traveling.

Marcie Evans: It makes sense then to go ahead and motion to the vote.

David Avila: Yes Marcy, I think it does make sense unless somebody has a serious reservation based on looking at the resume. He's fully engaged in Lifeline. Sola did confirm that she's still interested in joining the committee. He did comply with everything that Kelly had requested. I think that even though he's not here, I think there's still a strong desire to contribute to this committee and if somebody doesn't have a reservation, then I would concur with you Marcy, that we should vote and get somebody in.

Another topic, we have committee members here that are not participating like Andre Chappel, and both Kelly and I have reached out to him prior to the meetings, and this really puts us in a bind when we need to have strong participation if somebody's not genuinely interested.

Marcie Evans: David, I have been asking around to replace mine or one of the CBO slots or something along those lines, but at this point there's been NO interest, but I'm continuing to check for this.

Alex Gudkov: David, we have some interests, I mean Danielle Perry is interested in Applying as well. I just found out, so I don't know if you want to consider it or not.

Sindy Yun: I think one suggestion would be to take a vote on the two options, Option one would be to proceed with the election with Robert Yapp's nomination, and option two would be to postpone the election to the next meeting and then allow other nominations and to conduct the election at the next meeting. So maybe perhaps somebody could take a motion.

Marcie Evans: I'll make a motion to hold a vote to decide whether we're voting today or next session.

Robert Sansone: The motion is to determine whether the committee should vote today on evaluating Robert Yapp as a committee member or not.

- vote today on evaluating Robert Yapp as a committee member or not.

Chris Burke: Vote today

Marcie Vote Today

David Avila: Vote today

Alex Gudkov: Postpone Vote.

Kate Vote Today

Cesar Motts: Vote today

Chris Burtulo: Vote today

- Everyone's had a chance to review David Yapp's resume, so this is voting for Robert Yapp for a primary wireless position

Chris Burke: Yes

Marcie Evans: Yes

David Avila: Yes

Alex Gudkov: Yes

Kate Woodford: Yes

Cesar Motts: Yes

Chris Burtulo: Yes

Sindy Yun: next step David and Kellie work together to prepare a letter of nomination and submit it to the executive director, Rachel Peterson, for approval and appointment.

Robert Sansone: Just to follow up with your CBO comment. You're going to ask Andre if he's interested, I believe it's within the board's power to vote a person out of the position, especially for cause.

I believe staff in their resolution open CBO nonprofit community groups as kind of multiple positions. We could do in addition to Caesar, a foster used CBO, if you have another CBO in mind David, and alternates. All these positions have an alternate position. I don't see any reason why we shouldn't Take as many people as possible.

ULTS Administrative Committee Charter Positions:

- **12 open positions**
 - ILEC – 1 Alternate
 - CLEC – 1 Primary, 1 Alternate
 - Consumer – 1 Alternate
 - CBO – 2 Alternates
 - Wireless – 1 Alternate
 - CPUC Public Advocate Office 1 Alternate
 - Sister Agency – 1 Primary, 1 Alternate
 - Office of the Tribal Advisor – 1 Primary, 1 Alternate

Kellie Jones: I'm scheduling our Q1 meeting, and according to Robert, I'll have to reach out to the committee members to find out the best date so that meeting a quorum won't be an issue.

David Avila: thanks Kellie jones, Joseph Haga from IT, Robert Sansone, and Chari.

Motion to Adjourned:

Marcie Evans: Last Motion to Adjourned:

Cesar Mott: I second.

Meeting adjourned: 11:33 a.m.